NOTES ON THE GENUS BOMBINA OKEN (Anura: Bombinatoridae): III. ANATOMY, SYSTEMATICS, HYBRIDIZATION FOSSIL RECORD AND BIOGEOGRAPHY

MATHIAS LANG

Zoologisches Forschungsinstitut und Museum Alexander König, Adenauerallee 150-164, D-5300 Bonn 1, West Germany and Museum of Natural History, The University of Kansas, Lawrence, KS., USA 66045-2454

INTRODUCTION

This paper represents the last portion in a three-part series of papers summarizing pertinent information available on *Bombina*. Overall the series synthesizes information on distribution and characteristics of recognized species of *Bombina*, together with aspects of external appearances, morphology, life history, systematics and taxonomy. This paper focusses on aspects of anatomy, systematics, hybridization, fossil record and biogeography of *Bombina*.

ANATOMY

Embryology

Ossification in orientalis commences as early as Gosner Stage 37 (hind limbs with all five toes distinct), but the full complement of adult bones is not attained until Stage 46 (metamorphosis complete) (Hanken and Hall, 1984). The number of bones present at intermediate stages is poorly correlated with external morphology. The modal ossification sequence as presented by Hanken and Hall (1984) is as follows: frontoparietal, exoccipital, parasphenoid, septomaxilla, premaxilla, vomer, nasal, maxilla, angulosplenial, dentary, squamosal, quadratojugal, pterygoid, prootic, (interfrontal), sphenethmoid and mentomeckelian.

Embryonic stages and timing of development of *orientalis* has been investigated by Sussman and Betz (1978). *Bombina orientalis* is the only species of this genus that has an interfrontal bone (Tschugunova, 1981).

Pedicellate teeth are present in *bombina* and *maxima*. In *B. variegata* there is no clear division crown and pedicel (Parsons and Williams, 1962; Viertel, 1986). Vomerine teeth are situated slightly posteriorly to the inner nasal openings and arranged in two short rows and are distinctly pedicellate (Viertel, 1986). Marginal and vomerine teeth are bicuspid (see Viertel, 1986 for illustration).

De Villiers (1922) investigated and described in detail the structure and development of the pectoral girdle of *Bombina variegata*. The episternum develops relatively late during postmetamorphosis. The cleithrum develops from the cutis bordering the suprascapular, and the clavicle develops between the epidermis and the procoracoid. The omosternum fails to develop.

Larval morphology

Larval mouthparts of European *Bombina* are illustrated by Engelmann *et al.* (1985). *Bombina bombina* has a triangular upper lip, with three rows of denticles on the lower lip that are sometimes interrupted at the midline. In *variegata* the upper lip is semicircular, and the lower lip has three rows of denticles rarely interrupted at the midline.

The dorsal tail fin in larvae may (bombina) or may not (variegata) reach the middle of the dorsum. Tadpoles have a black reticulation on the tail. The spiracle is situated more closely to the anus than the mouth. Additional detailed descriptions of the tadpoles of the European Bombina can be found in Michalowski (1966) and Lanza (1983).

The tadpoles of *Bombina* have six short gill-filaments developed on a single large fleshy base. The tail crest is strongly developed in the stream breeders and reaches the nuchal region.

Skeletal anatomy

The cranial anatomy of *Bombina variegata* has been described extensively by Slabbert (1945). Following is a summary of some of the findings. The olfactory capsule has a well-developed lateral wall; the medial masal gland lies extra-capsular; the premaxilla lacks palatal squames; palatine entirely absent; frontoparietals are separated anteriorly by a wide stretch of connective ussue; the side walls of the cranial cavity in the orbital region are mainly membranous; three foramina acustica are present; the hyomandibular branch of the facial nerve passes through a narrow cranio-quadrate passage; the pseudobasal process articulates with a pointed ventral ledge of the otic capsule and the jaw suspension is autostylic; the sound conducting apparatus is reduced, with only the operculum being present (this perhaps in association with lack of vocal sacs); cornu hyale confluent with otic capsule; and the mentomeckelian is the only ossification of the Meckel's cartilage, which forms a synostosis with the dentary.

Böhme (1977) lists posteranial characteristics such as the presence of opisthocoelous vertebrae with free ribs; a slightly dilated sacrum, that can be quite variable (Madej, 1965); a free urostyle with lateral apophyses and a pars ascendens ilii that is less pronounced than the pars descendens ilii. The latter character is used to distinguish *Bombina* and European discoglossids (*Alytes & Discoglossus*) from other European Anurans (Böhme, 1977). A vexillum (= dorsal fin on puble ala) is absent in *Bombina*. The sacrum of *Bombina* has a single condyle that articulates with the presacral vertebra.

Karotypes

Bombina bombina and B. variegata show a strictly corresponding diploid set of 12 chromosome pairs for both sexes (Moreschalchi, 1965, 1971; Ullerich, 1970; Popov, 1983). The diploid number of *orientalis* is also 24 (Sato, 1938). There are six large, one medium, and five small pairs of chromosomes. All chromosomes are metacentric, except the sixth pair which is submetacentric. A secondary constriction is observed on the long arm of the seventh and the short arm of the eighth chromosome. No heteromorphic chromosome was found (Jiang *et al.*, 1984).

SYSTEMATICS

The taxonomy and systematics of *Bombina* is quite confusing. Sokol (1975, 1977) crected the suborder Discoglossoidei as a clade for the Leiopelmatidae (*Ascaphus* and *Leiopelma*) and Discoglossidae (*Alytes, Barbourula, Bombina*, and *Discoglossus*). The fusion of the copula to the hypobranchials, and the partially adherent anterior filter valves are two derived leatures of the latvae (Type 3) in support of the monophyly of this taxon. The latter character is also present in pipoid and microhylid larvae (Sokol, 1975). Dubois (1983) resurrected the subfamily Bombinatorinae Gray within Discoglossidae to include *Alytes, Bombina* and *Bombinator.* Tian and Hu (1985) furthermore suggest the subfavision of *Bombina* into the subgenera *Bombina*, containing the Palaearctic *bombina*, variegata and orientalis, and the Oriental *Glandula* containing maxima, microdeladigitora and fortinuptialis. This division was based on the presence of small, regular and evenly spaced warts in the *Bombina*-group, whereas these dorsal warts are irregular and unevenly spaced in *Glandula*-group; the absence of a parotid gland in the Palaearctic distribution of the *Bombina*-group versus the Oriental distribution of the *Bombina*-group.

Maxson and Szymura (1984) using micro-complement fixation showed that *Bombina* and *Discoglossus* shared a common lineage, separate from *Alytes* and *Baleaphryne*. These findings do not support Lanza et al.'s (1975, 1976) differentiation of Discoglossidae into two separate families: Discoglossidae (*Discoglossus*) and Bombinidae (*Bombina* and *Alytes*). The latter study was based on qualitative serological studies of serum proteins and *Barbourula* was not tested.

Olmo et al. (1982) could not resolve relationships within Discoglossidae because the karyotype and genome of *Discoglossus*, *Alytes* and *Bombina* are so heterogeneous and different from each other.

Cannatella (1985), showed the "Discoglossidae" to be paraphyletic, and correctly infers that the aforementioned biological estimates hinge on the underlying assumptions that the Discoglossidae (*sensu* Griffiths, 1963) was monophyletic. The possibility that some genera may be more closely related to other anurans was not tested. *Alytes* and *Discoglossus* are each others' closest relatives and are more closely related to other frogs than they are to *Bombina* and *Barbourula*. Cannatella (1985) therefore established the family Bombinatoridae to include *Bombina* and *Barbourula*. The presence of an unusual flange on the quadratojugal and paired ossifications of the hyoid plate are unique derived characters in support of the monophyly of Bombinatoridae (Cannatella, 1985).

Bombina itself has two unique apomorphies that support its monophyly. In all species of Bombina the anterior ramus of the pterygoid extends forward, curving medially to invest the posterior margin of the planum antorbitale. The otic ramus of the squamosal is present and well-developed in all frogs except in Bombina in which it is greatly reduced (Cannatella, 1985).

Within Bombina the relationships have not been fully worked out. Mertens (1928) suggests that orientalis descended from bombina and maxima from variegata. Terent'ev (1949) in contrast using biometrical data indicated that orientalis was derived from maxima. Using colouration patterns Stugren (1966) opts for the notion that orientalis and variegata are more closely related to one another than either is to bombina. Maxson and Szymura (1979) compared bombina, orientalis, and variegata immunologically and discussed relationships between these three species, with bombina and variegata being each others' closest relatives. This is further supported by the genetic similarity of these two species (Szymura and Farana, 1978). Schneider et al. (1986) suggest that the mating call of orientalis is close to that of variegata and that the parameters of the mating call of bombina suggests no relationship to either variegata or orientalis further supporting Stugren's (1966) hypothesis. Tian and Wu (1981) in the original type description of fortinuptialis indicate that this species is related to microdeladigitora. This is in contrast to the original type description of microdeladigitora (Liu and Hu, 1961), in which the authors indicate a relationship with maxima ¹.

HYBRIDIZATION

Natural hybrids of European *Bombina* have been known for quite some time (Mehely, 1905). Stable hybrid zones are identified in Poland (rather narrow zone through allopatric hybridization, Szymura, 1976; Szymura and Barton, 1986), in Czechoslovakia (Lac, 1961), in Lower Austria (zone of allopatric hybridization, Gollman, 1984) and in Yugoslavia (sympatric hybridization, Szymura, 1981; Gollman, 1986). Descriptions and characteristics of hybrids have been extensively investigated by Michalowski (1961, 1966), Michalowski and Madej (1969) and van den Elzen (1979). Characters for field identification of hybrids are provided by Gollman (1987).

Alleles from either species predominate clearly in each of the populations within this zone, but most of the individuals found there are from hybrid origin. Hödl and Gollman (1985) have furthermore investigated the bio-accoustics of these hybrid populations.

Rachmel (1974) reports on successful hybridization between B. variegata and B. orientalis.

FOSSIL RECORD

Fossil Bombina are known from the Lower Miocene of West Germany (Sanchiz and Schleich, 1986); the Middle Miocene of Poland (Mlynarski *et al.*, 1982); the Upper Pliocene of Central Poland (Mlynarski *et al.*, 1982; Sanchiz and Mlynarski, 1979); the Upper Pliocene-Lower Pleistocene of Czechoslovakia (Hodrova, 1981, 1985; Sanchiz and Szyndlar, 1984); and the Lower Pleistocene of Italy (Vergnaud-Grazziny, 1970).

BIOGEOGRAPHY

Stejneger (1907) indicated that *Bombina* originated from South Eastern Asia and dispersed northward and into Europe. Mertens (1928) proposes the late Tertiary as the timing of this European dispersal. This is in contrast to the European origin of *Bombina*, with subsequent dispersal into Asia as proposed by Friant (1960).

Mertens (1928) (further refined by Madej, 1964 and Arntzen, 1978) discuss the vicariant effect of one or more Pleistocene glaciations on the migration of *bombina* and *variegata* in Europe. Glaciation split the European stock into a western lineage (*variegata*) and an eastern lineage

¹ It should be noted that fortinuptialis was described later than microdelagitora.

(bombina). Bombina variegata sought refuge on mountain tops and differentiated, but was also pushed towards southern Europe, whereas *B. bombina* remained a lowland force. In the contact zone beween these two species (see above), enclaves of variegata are found on mountain tops. The mountain refugia are hypothesized to have arisen because of the northward postglacial advances of bombina that has superseded variegata in the surrounding lowlands in a process of hybridization and competition. Present day bombina is restricted to areas below 250m. Szymura (1983) using Nei's genetic distance between Polish bombina and variegata, suggests a Pliocene separation of these species. The Pliocene divergence proposed by Szymura (1983) is earlier than the Pleistocene separation as proposed by Mertens (1928) and Arntzen (1978).

Pracht (1987) furthermore indicates that the speciation between the two European Bombina is not complete as evidenced by the hybridization in the postglacial contact zones (see above).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank Wolfgang Böhme for comments and help with references and William E. Duellann and Linda Trueb for reviewing an early draft of the manuscript. This study was supported by a stipend from the Deutscher Akademischer Austausch Dienst.

LITERATURE CITED

- Arntzen, J.W. (1978). Some hypotheses on postglacial migrations of the fire-bellied toad, Bombina bombina (Linnaeus) and the yellow-bellied toad, Bombina variegata (Linnaeus). J. Biogeography 5: 335-345.
- Böhme, (1977). Zür Bestimmung quartärer Anuren Europas an Hand von Skelettelementen. Wissensch. Zeitschr. Humboldt-Univ. Berlin, *Mat.-Nat.*, 26 (3): 183-300.
- Cannatella, D. (1985). A phylogeny of primitive frogs (Archaeobatrachians). PhD Dissertation, The University of Kansas; 404 pp.
- de Villiers, C.G.S. (1922). Neue Beobachtungen über den Bau und die Entwickelung des Brustschulterapparates bei den Anuren, inssbesonders bei Bombinator. Acta Zoologica, 1922 (3): 153-225.
- Dubois, A. (1983). Classification of nomenclature supragenerique des amphibiens anoures. Bull. de la Soc. Linn. de Lyon. 52 (9): 170-276.
- Engelmann, W.-E., Fritzsche, J., Günther, R. and F.J. Obst. (1985). Lurche und Kriechetiere Europas. Neumann Verlag, Leipzig. 420 pp.
- Friant, M. (1960). Les batraciens anoures, characteres osteologiques des Discoglossidae d'Europe. Acta Zool., Stockholm, 41: 113-139.
- Gollman, G. (1984). Allozymic and morphological variation in the hybrid zone between Bombina bombina and Bombina variegata (Anura, Discoglossidae) in north eastern Austria. Z. Zool. Syst. Evolut. forsch., 22: 51-64.
- Gollman, G. (1986). Genetic analysis of Bombina from eastern Slovakia. Studies in Herpetology, Prague: 121-126.
- Gollman, G. (1987). Möglichkeiten der Freilanddiagnose von Hybriden der Rotbauch- und Gelbbauchunke, Bombina bombina (Linnaeus, 1758) und Bombina variegata (Linnaeus, 1758). Salamandra 23 (1): 43-51.
- Griffiths, I. (1963). The phylogeny of the Salientia. Biol. Rev. 38: 241-292.
- Hanken, J. and Hall, B.K. (1984). Variation and timing of the cranial ossification sequence of the oriental fire-bellied toad, *Bombina orientalis* (Amphibia, Discoglossidae). J. Morph. 182: 245-255.
- Hödl, W. and Gollman, G. (1985). Bioakustische Freilandsuntersuchungen an hybriden Unkenpopulationen. Verh. Dtsch. Zool. Ges. 78: 340.
- Hodrova, M. (1981). Plio-Pleistocene frog fauna from Hajnacka and Ivanovce, Czechoslovakia. Vest. ust. geo., 56 (4): 215-224.

Hodrova, M. (1985). Amphibia of pliocene and pleistocene vcelare localities (Slovakia). Casopis pro mineralogii a geologii, roc. 330 (2): 145-168.

Jiang, S., Wen, C., Shen, C. and Men, Y. (1984). Preliminary observations on karyotype of Bombina orientalis. Acta Herpetol. Sinica 3 (1): 25-27.

- Lac, J. (1961). Rozsirenie Kuncov (Bombina bombina L. a Bombina variegata L.) na slovenska a k problematike ich vzajomneho krizenia. Biologicke Prace, Bratislava 7/3: 5-32.
- Lanza, B. (1983). Guide per il riconosciemento delle specie animali delle acque interne italiane. 27. Anfibi, Rettili. (Amphibia, Reptilia). Consiglio Nazionale delle Ricerche; 196 pp.
- Lanza, B., Cei, J.M. and Crespo, E.G. (1975). Immunological evidence for the specific status of *Discoglossus pictus* Otth, 1837 and *D. sardus* Tschudi, 1837, with notes on the families Discoglossidae Günther, 1858 and Bombinidae Fitzinger, 1826 (Amphibia, Salientia). *Monit. Zool. Ital.* (N.S.) 9: 153-162.
- Lanza, B., Cei, J.M. and Crespo, E.G. (1976). Further immunological evidence for the validity of the family Bombinidae (Amphibia, Salienta). *Monit. Zool. Italiano N.S.* Suppl., 4 (8): 185-205.
- Liu, C.C. and Hu, S. (1961). Tailless amphibians of China. Beijing: Science Press.
- Madej, Z. (1964). Studies on the fire-bellied toad Bombina bombina (Linnaeus, 1761) and yellow bellied toad Bombina variegata (Linnaeus, 1758) of Upper Silesia and Moravian Gate. Acta zool. cracov. 9: 291-334.
- Madej, Z. (1965). Variations in the sacral region of the spine in Bombina bombina (Linnaeus, 1758) (Salienta, Discoglossidae).. Acta Biologica Cracoviensia, Ser. Zoologica (Krakow) VIII: 185-197.
- Maxon, L.R. and Szymura, J.R. (1979). Quantitative immunological studies of the albumins of several species of fire bellied toads, genus Bombina. Comp. Biochem. Physiol., 63 (B): 517-519.
- Maxon, L.R. and Szymura, J.R. (1984). Relationships among discoglossid frogs: an albumin perspective. Amphibia-Reptilia 5 (3-4): 245-252.
- Mchely, L. (1905). Die herpetologischen Verhältnisse des Mecsek-Gebirges und der Kapela. Ann. hist.-nat. Mus. Nat. Hung., Budapest, 3: 256-316.
- Mertens, R. (1928). Zur Naturgeschichte der Europäischen Unken (Bombina). Zs. Morph. Oaek. Tiere, 11: 613-623.
- Michalowski, J. (1961). Studies on the species characters in *Bombina variegata* (Linnaeus) and Bombina bombina (Linnaeus). 1. Applying the L:T indicator to the classifying purposes. Acta zool. Cracov. 6: 51-59.
- Michalowski, J. (1966). Studies on the relationship of Bombina bombina (Linnaeus) and Bombina variegata (Linnaeus). 2. Some taxonomic characters of tadpoles obtained from crosses under laboratory conditions. Acta Zool. cracov. 11: 181-208.
- Michalowski, J., and Madej; Z. (1969). Studies on the relationships of Bombina bombina (Linnaeus) and Bombina variegata (Linnaeus). 3. Taxonomic characters in both species from laboratory and in interspecific hybrids. Acta zool. cracov. 14: 173-202.
- Mlynarski, M., Szyndlar, Z., Estes, R.D. and Sanchiz, B. (1982). Lower vertebrate fauna from the Miocene of Opole (Poland). *Estudios geologicos.*, 38: 103-119.
- Morescalchi, A. (1965). Obsservazioni sulla cariologia di Bombina. Boll. Zool., 32 (2): 207-218.
- Morescalchi, A. (1971). Comparative karyology of the amphibia. Boll. Zool., 38: 317-320.
- Olmo, E., Morescalchi, A., Stingo, V. and Odierna, G. (1982). Genome characteristics and the systematics of Discoglossidae (Amphibia: Salienta). *Monitore Zool. Ital. (N.S.)* 16: 283-299.

- Parsons, T. and Williams, E.E. (1962). The teeth of amphibia and their relation to amphibian phylogeny. J. Morph. 110 (3): 375-390.
- Popov, P. (1983). Investigation of the karyotype of Bombina variegata (Amphibia, Ecaudata, Discoglossidae). Nauchni Trud. plovidiv. Univ. Paissi Khil. 21 (4): 357-364.
- Pracht, A. (1987). Über Evolution und Systematik der Gattung Bombina. Salamandra 23 (1): 68-69.
- Rachmel, C.-A. (1974). Eine gelungene Kreuzung zwischen Bombina v. variegata und Bombina orientalis (Salientia, Discoglossidae). Salamandra 10 (3/4): 136-137.
- Sanchiz, B. and Mlynarski, M. (1979). Remarks on the fossil anurans from the Polish Neogene. Acta zool. cracov. 24: 153-174.
- Sanchiz, B. and Schleich, H.H. (1986). Erstnachweis der Gattung Bombina (Amphibia: Anura) im Untermiozan Deutschlands. Mitt. Bayer. Stratsslg. Paläontol. hist. Geol. 26: 41-44.
- Sanchiz, B. and Szyndlar, Z. (1984). Pleistocene amphibian fauna from Kozi Grebiet in the Holy Cross Mts. Acta Geologica Polonica 34 (1-2): 51-62.
- Sato, I. (1938). On the chromosomes of the oriental fire-bellied toad Bombina orientalis, with special reference to the multiple-ring-tetrad (Urodelan type). Jour. Sci. Hiroshima Univ., Ser. B, Div. 1 6: 53-70.
- Schneider, H., Hussein, F. and Mamdouh, S.A.A. (1986). Comparative bioacoustic studies in the yellow-bellied toad, *Bombina variegata* (L.), and the relationships of European and Asian species and subspecies of the genus *Bombina*. *Bonn. zool. Beitr.* 37 (1): 49-67.
- Slabbert, G.K. (1945). Contributions to the cranial morphology of the european anuran Bombina variegata (Linne). Ann. Univ. Stellenbosch, 23 (A) (2-6): 67-89.
- Sokol, O.M. (1975). The phylogeny of anuran larvae: a new look. Copeia, 1975: 1-23.
- Sokol, O.M. (1977). A subordinal classification of frogs (Amphibia: Anura). J. Zool., London 182: 505-508.
- Stejneger, L. (1907). Herpetology of Japan and adjacent territory. Bull. U.S. Nat. Mus. 58: 1-577.
- Stugren, B. (1966). Eidonomische Untersuchungen an Bombina orientalis aus dem fernen Osten. Zool. Anz., 177 (5/6): 340-347.
- Sussman, P. and Betz, T.W. (1978). Embryonic stages: Morphology, timing and vicariance in the toad Bombina orientalis. Can J. Zool. 56: 1540-1545.
- Szymura, J.M. (1976). Hybridization between discoglossid toads *Bombina bombina* and *Bombina variegata* in southern Poland as revealed by the electrophoretic technique. *Z. Zool. Evolut.* forsch. 14: 227-236.
- Szymura, J.M. (1981). Hybrid zones between Bombina bombina and B. variegata in Yugoslavia. Societas Europaea Herpetologica, First Ordinary Meeting, Abstr. 9f. Wien.
- Szymura, J.M. (1983). Genetic differentiation between hybridizing species Bombina bombina and Bombina variegata (Salientia, Discoglossidae) in Poland. Amphibia-Reptilia (4): 137-145.
- Szymura, J.M. and Barton, N.H. (1986). Genetic analysis of a hybrid zone between the firebellied toads, Bombina bombina and B. variegata near Cracow in Southern Poland. Evolution 40: 1141-1159.
- Szymura, and Farana, I. (1978). Inheritance and linkage analysis of five enzyme loci in interspecific hybrids of toadlets, genus *Bombina*. *Biochem. Genetics* 16: 307-319.
- Tarent'ev, P.W. (1949). Wsaimootnoschenija sherljanok. Naturn. bjull. Leningr. Univ., 24: 25-32.

- Tian, W. and Wu, G. (1981). In: S. Hu, W. Tian and G. Wu. Three new species of amphibians from Guangxi. Acta Herpetol. Sinica, 5(17): 111-120.
- Tian, W. and Hu, Q. (1985). Taxonomical studies on the primitive anurans of the Hengduan mountains, with descriptions of a new subfamily and subdivision of *Bombina*. Acta herpetol. Sinica 4(3): ?19-224.
- Tschugunova, T.J. (1981). Interfrontalia in Bombina orientalis (Blgr.) and Bombina bombina (L.). In: L.J. Borkin (cd.): Herpetological investigations in Siberia and the Far East, Moscow: Acad. Sci. USSR, Zool. Inst: 117-121.
- Ullerich, F. -H. (1970). DNA Gehatt und Chromosumenstructur bei Amfibien. Chromosoma 30: 1-37.
- Van den Elzen, P. (1979). Remarques sur Bombina orientalis (Boulenger, 1890) (Salientia, Bombinidae). Rev. fr. Aquariol., 6(2): 59-64.
- Vergnaud-Grazzini, C. (1970). Les amphibiens fossiles du gisement d'Arondelli. Pal. Ital., 66(36): 47-65.
- Viertel, B. (1986). Bestimmungsmerkmale in der Mundhöhlenn der metamorphosierten, zahntragenden mitteleuropäischen Anura (Amphibia). Zool. Anz. 216(1/2): 19-31.